

CHAUTAUQUA INSTITUTION
Architectural Review Board Meeting
Thursday, June 27, 2024
4840 W. Lake Rd., Chautauqua, NY 14722
MINUTES

Members Present: **CHAIR ANITA LIN, PAUL HAGMAN, IZUMI HARA, TERRY HORNER and BILL NECHES**

Members Absent:

Chautauqua Institution Staff and Outside Counsel Present: **RYAN BOUGHTON, JOHN SHEDD, JENNIFER MAJEWSKI and DANA LUNDBURG**

I. Welcome

Ms. Lin called the meeting to order and welcomed all attendees. She then reviewed the agenda and the order of business.

II. Requests for Variances

A. 24-05 AFRICAN AMERICAN HERITAGE HOUSE 40 Scott

Ted First, representative, was present with revised plans proposing an addition to the west side of the building on to an empty lot in common ownership.

Variances requested:

1. For new construction crossing a Lot line separating two Lots in common ownership under ALU Regulation 5.4.1

NEIGHBOR COMMENTS:

1. Marisa Rogers – 44 Scott – L - objection

After presentation by the applicant and review of the comments, the following resolution was proposed by Izumi Hara:

WHEREAS, the ARB has determined that the design of the combined structure as presented to this meeting continues to reinforce the contextual pattern of the neighborhood.

BE IT RESOLVED, the requested variance for construction crossing an interior lot line in common ownership under ALU Regulation 5.4.1 be granted.

Following discussion, the resolution PASSED.

*L- Means comment submitted by letter

*P – Means appeared before ARB in person

** Neighbor resides outside of 150' notice zone

Chris Cooke, architect, was present with revised plans proposing for a whole house renovation requesting to replace the majority of the building's exterior windows with compliant aluminum-clad wood windows, as well as the addition of an attached garage.

Variations requested:

1. Replacement of the majority of the building's exterior windows with compliant aluminum-clad wood windows under ALU Regulation 4.2.2.3.4
2. Variance for encroachment into the rear yard setback on the southwest side of the property under ALU Regulation 4.4.6

NEIGHBOR COMMENTS:

Tim & Moureen Jahrling – 3 Hurst – L,P – objection

Jim Miller 41 N. Lake – L – objection

Stephen Still – 8 Hurst – L – objection

Karen Williams & Kurt Miller – 30 forest – L – objection**

Laura Dawson – 6 Cookman – L – objection**

Robert Kyler – 4 McClintock – L – objection

Sheri Sacks – 9 Hurst – L – objection

After presentation by the applicant and review of the comments, the Chair elected to consider each variance separately.

1. A motion was made by Bill Neches to grant a variance to replace a majority of the building's exterior windows with compliant aluminum clad wood windows, keep current windows that are salvageable and replace other historic windows with wood frame replica windows under ALU Regulations 4.2.2.3.4, as presented to this meeting.

Following discussion, the motion PASSED.

2. A motion was made by Terry Horner to grant a variance for construction of a garage within 10'0" of a neighboring structure under ALU Regulation 4.4.6.

Following discussion, the motion FAILED.

Ed Schober, architect, was present with revised plans proposing replacement vinyl siding. The current siding is deteriorating.

Variations requested:

*L- Means comment submitted by letter

*P – Means appeared before ARB in person

** Neighbor resides outside of 150' notice zone

1. For replacement of vinyl siding and trim with vinyl siding and trim under ALU Regulation 4.4.2

NEIGHBOR COMMENTS:

Sunny Pane, Board member @ St Elmo, - P – talked about cost hardship
Chris Rupp – 1 pratt – P – no objection
Selden Campen -1 pratt – P – no objection
Chaz Kerschner1 pratt – P – no objection

After presentation by the applicant and review of the comments, the following resolution was proposed by Bill Neches:

WHEREAS, the condominium building at 1 Pratt (St. Elmo) was constructed at a time when vinyl siding was a permissible material under the ALU Regulations, and

WHEREAS, at the time of its construction, the St. Elmo, a 5-story building, was designed to accept vinyl siding and trim and was uniquely constructed with a steel frame structure with metal stud exterior walls spaced 24” on center and two layers of 5/8” Type X fire-resistant gypsum sheathing on each side of the metal studs; and

WHEREAS, due to the stud spacing and thickness of the exterior sheathing and the weight of any proposed ALU Regulation compliant siding, retrofitting the building to accept such compliant siding would likely be technically infeasible and in any event would create extreme financial hardship on its 60 residential owners and 7 commercial owners; and

WHEREAS, the ARB acknowledges that the St. Elmo’s architects, at the ARB’s request, conducted extensive research on alternative compliant siding and whether it could feasibly be used on the St. Elmo, now therefor

BE IT RESOLVED, that the variance for the replacement of vinyl siding and trim with vinyl siding and trim under ALU Regulation 4.2.2.5.2 is hereby granted.

Following discussion, the resolution PASSED.

III. Approval or Prior Meeting Minutes

Minutes from the ARB meeting of February 1, and May 2, 2024 were tabled by unanimous consent.

There being no further business, the Chair declared the meeting adjourned.

Respectfully submitted,

Jennifer Majewski

*L- Means comment submitted by letter

*P – Means appeared before ARB in person

** Neighbor resides outside of 150’ notice zone